

2012 巴黎三年展：激烈的迫近
LA TRIENNALE 2012: INTENSE PROXIMITY

巴黎东京宫 PALAIS DE TOKYO, PARIS 2012.04.20~2012.08.26



展览现场，2012年
巴黎东京宫
View of “La Triennale”
2012
Palais de Tokyo, Paris
PHOTO: André Morin

巴黎三年展原名“艺术的力量”，由法国文化部在2006年创办，专门展出法国当代艺术。前两届展会在大皇宫举行，展品大多出自本土且平平无奇，没能迎来翘首以待的国际声誉。“艺术的力量”暴露出的更多是这一领域的弱点。到了第三届，修改后的规章将展览范围扩大到所有在“法国艺术现场”工作的艺术家，这便给予了艺术总监奥奎·恩维佐极其充分的空间去定义和把玩这个界限——他本人也不是法国人。在最近一次整修中，东京宫新开辟出了14000平方米的空间，使得整个美术馆的面积达到了令人惊叹的22000平方米。在恩维佐与他的协同策展团队——梅拉妮·布特卢、阿卜杜拉·卡鲁穆、艾米莉·荷纳和克莱尔·斯台布雷——的辛勤工作下，超过120位艺术家和其他野心勃勃的出版物、表

演团体及外场计划一同进驻了这个庞大的空间。

“激烈的迫近”在修辞上是一种对“民族志诗学”的探索；这一缺乏确定性定义的学科曾通过引入“他者”观点打破了西方世界对表述权的垄断。展览的标题也反映了人种学研究的惯用方法，即承认和接纳不同视角，并使它们发生接触。这种策略影响的绝不仅是某些表现意义上的传统，恩维佐的真正意图似乎是要让法国再度直面其殖民历史。本届三年展无意重提和建构国别美学，而是在暗中消解国家这一概念本身。

作为“反美术馆”的代表，东京宫的弧形墙壁和超高天花板一直令各路策展人头痛，新建地下层工业化的粗糙风格更与白盒子的空间概念形成鲜明对比。油漆斑驳地覆盖在各种侵入式建筑元素上，

而电缆和通风系统始终轰鸣作响。(美术馆的“模组”项目甚至在楼梯下和水泥船上展出作品。)

三年展正是利用了这样过于刺激的环境,试图复制挡在艺术作品前的重重障碍——相互冲突的参照物和概念系统。在中心的主厅中有两块背对放置的显示屏,像是双向的麦克风,屏幕上交替放映着阿德里安·派珀的视频和讲座,其中包括《神秘的存在》的录像和一系列近期的作品片段,其中一些“种族局外人”正在教授系着黑色领带的白人们跳舞。沃克·埃文斯拍摄的75张非洲面具在屏幕上方将空洞的目光投向梅沙克·伽巴的《婚房》。作为伽巴的移动《非洲当代艺术馆》的一部分,这个装置在报纸包裹的木板上展出艺术家婚礼用品,既有人类学档案的意味,又像是露天市场。一旁的照片中,伽巴的金发新娘绕过埃文斯的面具,凝视着维克多·曼表现暗黑的画作《基督降架》。画布之下,派珀的屏幕上播放着2003年电影《乌龙元首》的节选,黑人笑星克里斯·洛克带领一票政客正随着饶舌歌手奈利的热力舞曲大跳劲舞。

这种体验更像是一种交汇而非对话。幸好,身份政治依然以种种隐晦的方式出现在展览之中,使观者停顿并重新思考艺术品之间的联系。比方说,在埃文斯《非洲黑人艺术作品集》背后展出的是克劳德·列维-施特劳斯和皮埃尔·费杰的摄影及研究材料。当我们思索一个贝宁男人迎娶荷兰妻子有何意义,或派珀的《神秘的存在》为何如此别具魅力时,列维-施特劳斯的笔记会提醒我们这样的思考和理解源自何处。

另一面墙上,罗琳·奥格雷迪的《异族通婚家庭相簿》可被看作是主体人类学的一种尝试:她的十六联双折画将埃及王后纳芙蒂蒂的肖像与姐姐德沃妮娅的照片并置,在两个女人相似的杏眼和紧闭双唇的微笑中发现了血缘关系的可能性。文化异装的游戏在莉莉·雷诺·德瓦扮演黑人的表演中也有体现;这件问题重重的作品一向向约瑟芬·贝克致敬,一面在批判中剥去这位舞者的迷人外壳。在一幅静照中,雷诺·德瓦娇小的身躯被涂黑,与她工作室中的雕塑浑然一体;同样的身体则在舞蹈录像中摇摆起舞,表演的标题“先生,可惜你是个建筑师,否则你会是个绝妙的舞伴”(约瑟芬·贝克)取自柯布西耶与贝克的韵事:风传这位建筑大师曾为引诱“黑人维纳斯”将自己装扮成她的模样。在三年展的语境中,这个故事并未出现在墙上的标签中;而录像装置在空间上被一系列白色物体笨拙的包围——从大理石女体塑像到布莱恩·多赫提《白盒子内部》文章的复本,每一样都在不同程度上被涂黑。这样廉价的微薄使录像和照片电击般的观感消失殆尽——引用伊托·巴拉达的《谨慎提议》:“我并不奇异;我累极了。”

如果说三年展试图将相隔甚远的观点聚合在一处,它也同时在用恐惧这一概念衡量这些观点间原本的距离。里克力·提拉瓦尼用喷满整面大厅墙壁的字母与法西斯德应和,也提醒我们:“恐惧吞噬心灵”。恐惧凝视着让-吕克·穆莱纳的《阿姆斯特丹的女儿们》;她们蜷缩身体,等待检视,就像超市里打包待售的肉鸡。在克洛德·克罗斯基的拼贴作品

《城镇与国家》中,恐惧成为笑点的来源:照片中的模特们因她们的不同行为获得各异的死刑判决,一个在裘皮睡袋里慵懒伸展的褐发女人被判处“死在洞穴里”,而另一个洗发的女人被判“死在发型糟糕的一天”。恐惧在蒂莫西·阿什1975年的纪录片《斧战》的叙事中也扮演着重要角色。在这部饱受争议的影片中,阿什凭借个人理解,对委内瑞拉南部亚诺马米部落分支间的一次争斗作了旁白。(而这个部落的鸟类绘画是洛泰尔·鲍姆加滕作品《巴西断片》的核心所在)远端的角落里,安东尼·蒙塔达《恐惧的构建》中贩卖恐慌的报纸头条成为提拉瓦尼伪涂鸦的最后回响。

是什么构成了这种恐惧?我们很容易将其简单理解为对他者的恐惧,但恩维佐与他的策展团队希望梳理出更强的自我指涉性。在外场的贝东沙龙画廊,平行展览“热带狂:植物的社会生活”从植物种子(或阿莫斯·吉泰电影《菠萝》中的菠萝)的位移中,透视出社会经济关联,但它真正揭露的却是至今困扰法兰西的本国近代史。这种讽刺也体现在帕布罗·布隆斯坦绘制的洛可可钟表纹样中:各个殖民地出产的热带水果汇聚成一盘巴黎的水果沙拉。文森森林的“殖民花园”(臭名昭著的1907及1931年巴黎殖民博览会原址)被狡猾更名为“热带农业花园”,而记录这一变更的文件成为浓缩此次展览的最佳历史佐证。从三年展整体来看,恩维佐无意替代或弥补这段过去;“激烈的迫近”实际所指的是当代法国与其殖民历史间微乎其微的距离。

凯特·萨顿 (由康康翻译)

Once known as *La Force de l'Art*, the Paris Triennale was founded in 2006 by the Ministry of Culture as a showcase for French contemporary art. The previous two editions paraded a dependably bland selection of local wares through the center of the Grand Palais, but the anticipated international acclaim never materialized and *La Force de l'Art* ended up speaking more to the scene's shortcomings.

With this third Triennale, the rules have shifted to include artists “working within the French scene,” giving artistic director Okwui Enwezor—no Frenchman himself, mind you—room to play with the criteria for how that scene is defined. A lot of room. The exhibition has been moved to the Palais de Tokyo, making it the first to take full advantage of the recent renovation that has rehabilitated 14,000 square meters of previously unused space (bringing the museum's total area to a staggering 22,000 square meters.) It's a massive venue, but Enwezor fills it to capacity, recruiting a team of four accomplished assistant curators—Mélanie Bouteloup, Abdellah Karroum, Emilie Renard, and Claire Staebler—to handle the roster of over 120 artists

and the equally ambitious program of publications, performances, and offsite projects.

In its rhetoric, "Intense Proximity" seeks to explore "the poetics of ethnography," concentrating on the ways the discipline challenged Western monopolies on representation by introducing other viewpoints. As ethnography itself is never a definitive science, the exhibition's title refers to its strategy of recognizing heterogeneous perspectives by bringing them into contact with one another. This strategy leaves more than traditions of representation at stake; it would seem Enwezor's true aim is to confront France with its own colonialist history. Rather than celebrate a national aesthetic, this Triennale slyly dismantles the very notion of a nation.

A self-proclaimed "anti-museum par excellence," the Palais de Tokyo has always challenged curators with its rounded walls and soaring ceilings. Now, the insistently raw, industrial character of the new basement levels breaks even further from the white cube. Paint appears only in patches along the intrusive architectural elements, while the entire building hums with the buzzing of ventilation systems and electrical wires. (The museum's "Modules" program literally finds work crouching under staircases or hiding out in concrete hulls.)

"Intense Proximity" uses this overstimulative environment to a curatorial end, as a means to replicate the barrage of competing references and networks engaged when encountering a work of art. To understand how such "proximity" functions, take for example one of the exhibition's main intersections: on the floor in the center of the space sit two monitors, attached but facing in opposite directions like a double-sided megaphone. Their screens alternate a selection of video and lectures from Adrian Piper, which range from documentation of his *Mythic Being* to a collection of recent film clips featuring "ethnic outsiders" teaching white people in black ties to break loose and dance. Above the monitors, 75 African masks photographed by Walker Evans send their empty gazes out across the room to Meschac Gaba's *Marriage Room*, which answers back with strains of Dusty Springfield's "I Only Want to be with You!" A component of Gaba's mobile *Museum of Contemporary African Art*, the installation oscillates between an anthropological archive and an open-air market, displaying artifacts from the artist's wedding on wooden palettes covered with newspaper. In the accompanying images, Gaba's beaming blonde bride

looks past Evans' masks, and across the room to Victor Man's dark *Deposition* (2008) which suggests a ceremony for a far less joyous occasion. Beneath the canvas, Piper's monitor is now broadcasting a clip from the 2003 film *Head of State*, with the comedian Chris Rock leading a room full of politicians in a choreographed grind to Nelly's "Hot in Herre."

The experience is not so much a conversation as a confluence. Thankfully, the various undercurrents of identity politics pool at certain points in the exhibition, giving the viewer a chance to stop and rethink the relationships between the objects encountered. For instance, neatly tucked behind Evans' *African Negro Art Portfolio* is a quiet enclave of photographs and research materials from Claude Levi-Strauss and Pierre Verger. Looking at Levi-Strauss' notebooks, one is reminded of what informs one's readings of what it means when a Beninese artist takes a Dutch wife or what just it is about Piper's *Mythic Being* that makes it so different, so appealing.

On the other side of that same wall, Lorraine O'Grady attempts subjective anthropology of her own with the stunning *Miscegenated Family Album*. The set of sixteen diptychs pairs depictions of the Egyptian queen Nefertiti with photographs of O'Grady's sister Devonnia, carving out a potential lineage from the likeness in their wide, almond-shaped eyes and tight-lipped smiles. This kind of cultural cross-dressing plays—perhaps more problematically—into the work of Lili Reynaud Dewar, who experiments with black-face in an ode to Josephine Baker that comes off as half courtship and half a critical dismantling of the dancer's tricks. In a framed performance still, Reynaud Dewar's tiny, blackened body is barely distinguishable from the sculptures in her studio, but in the video footage of the same performance, this body springs to life, shimmying and side-stepping across the floor. The title of Reynaud Dewar's performance—"What a pity you're an architect, Monsieur. You'd make a sensational partner" (*After Josephine Baker*)—references an alleged dalliance between Le Corbusier and Baker, during which the esteemed architect attempted to seduce the "Ebony Venus" by dressing up in her image. In the context of the Triennale, this history is left out of the wall label; instead the video of the performance is clumsily folded into a larger installation of "white" objects—from a marble torso of a woman to a copy of Brian



展览现场, 2012年
巴黎东京宫
前景: 埃伦·加拉格尔
《吗啡》, 2008-2012年
后景: 克洛德·克劳斯基
《城镇与国家》
2009-2010年
View of "La Triennale"
2012
Palais de Tokyo, Paris
Foreground: Ellen
Gallagher, *Morphia*
2008-2012
Background: Claude Closky
*Town & Country (To
die...)*, 2009-2010
PHOTO: André Morin

O'Doherty's *Inside the White Cube*—all smeared in various stages of black-face. This cheekiness is cheap, bereft of the electric thrill of whatever it was the artist was on to in her studio. (To quote a poster from Yto Barrada's *Modest Proposal*: "I'M NOT EXOTIC, I'M EXHAUSTED.")

If the exhibition presumes to bring distant ideas into proximity, then it also assumes that the original distance between these positions can be measured in Fear. After all, *FEAR EATS THE SOUL*, as Rirkrit Tiravanija reminds us, with a spray-painted nod to Fassbinder that covers the entire wall of the lobby. Fear leers before Jean-Luc Moulène's grisly *Filles d'Amsterdam* (2004) who lie folded up for inspection like so many grocery store chickens; it provides the punchlines for Claude Closky's tongue-in-cheek *Town & Country* collages, which assign models death sentences according to their simulated activity. (The brunette languorously stretched out in a fur-lined sleeping bag is fated "To Die in a Cave," while another getting a shampoo, "To Die on a Bad Hair Day.") Fear even steps in and fills in the story line for Timothy Asch's controversial 1975 documentary film, *The Ax Fight*, in which the ethnographer projects his own reading on what appears to be a brawl between factions of a Yānomāmi tribe in Southern Venezuela (the same society whose drawings of birds make up one crux of Lothar Baumgarten's *Fragmento Brasil*). Eventually, Tiravanija's faux

graffiti eventually finds its printed echo in the panic-mongering newspaper headlines of Antoni Muntadas' *The Construction of Fear* tucked in the very back corner of the basement.

But what constitutes this Fear? At first, it may read as a run-of-the-mill Fear of the Other, but then Enwezor and his curators are angling to tease out something more self-reflexive. At Bétonsalon, one of the Triennale's offsite venues, the parallel project "Tropicomania: The Social Life of Plants" purports to track socio-economic relations through the movement of seeds (or pineapples, as in the case of Amos Gitai's *Ananas*). What it really tracks, however, is France's still very harried relationship with its recent history (as illustrated in a wry Pablo Bronstein drawing of a rococo clock, decorated with a motif of the tropical produce from various colonies coming together for Paris' fruit salad). The entire exhibition could be encapsulated in the documents surrounding the sleight of hand that turned the "Colonial Gardens" of the *bois de Vincennes*—the site of the notorious colonial exhibitions of 1907 and 1931—into the more docile "Garden of Tropical Agriculture." With the Triennale as a whole, however, Enwezor is not interested in unmasking some grand substitution; what he is pointing to is indeed an "Intense Proximity," by revealing just how little distance lies between France and its colonial past.

Kate Sutton